

Implementation of KKNI-Based Curriculum Management in the English Education Study Program to Improve the Quality of Graduates at Muhammadiyah University Tangerang

Siti Mariyanah

Insan Pembangunan Indonesia University, Indonesia

Email: smariyanah321str@gmail.com

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to investigate: (1) the planning, implementation, and evaluation of the curriculum based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNI) in the English Education Study Program, and (2) the supporting and inhibiting factors. This research uses a qualitative approach to describe the phenomena observed in the field. Data were collected through interviews guided by predetermined frameworks and instruments, observations, and document studies related to the curriculum of the English Education Study Program. The findings reveal that the curriculum planning aligns with the vision and mission of the English Education Study Program, which is geared towards enhancing the quality of graduates and professionalism through learning processes that meet the expected learning outcomes. The implementation of the curriculum, as designed under the KKNI framework, is reinforced by a well-structured management plan for the English Education Program. Evaluation of the curriculum's implementation is shown to enhance graduate quality, as the study program's graduates consistently demonstrate improvements in quality. The research outcomes include: (1) solving issues related to English language teaching, (2) providing conclusions on these challenges, (3) planning, implementing, managing, evaluating, and improving English language teaching, (4) taking responsibility for the quality of the outcomes, and (5) producing graduates equipped with the skills needed to compete in the job market.

Keywords: Curriculum Management, English Education, Graduate Quality

1. Introduction

English is an international language that is essential, especially for communication in scientific knowledge and information exchange. In Indonesia's education system, English is included as a General Core Subject from elementary to secondary levels and even becomes a major at the higher education level.

In order to enhance the qualifications of university graduates in Indonesia, the government issued Presidential Regulation No. 08 of 2012 concerning the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNI), which serves as a reference for formulating learning outcomes. This framework consists of nine academic qualification levels and eight stages of implementation. These range from elementary school graduates (Level 1), high school or vocational school graduates (Level 2), diploma holders (Levels 3, 4, and 5), professional education graduates (Level 6), and bachelor's, master's, and doctoral degrees (Levels 7, 8, and 9, respectively).

To improve the quality of university graduates, certain standards must be met at each level, including: (1) learning outcomes, (2) total credit hours, (3) minimum study time, (4) mandatory courses to achieve general competency in English, (5) student-centered learning processes, (6) assessment accountability, and (7) the necessity for a Diploma Supplement (an additional document accompanying a diploma and transcript).

This approach makes KKNi a reference point for all stakeholders concerned with the development of human resources, whether within the workplace, society at large, or individuals planning their career development. Formal education, particularly at the higher education level, can use the curriculum as a guide for designing learning systems that equip graduates with qualifications aligned with career levels in the workforce.

2. Theoretical Foundation

2.1. Curriculum Management Theory

The term "management" comes from "to manage," which means to organize, oversee, or administer. In essence, management involves activities related to organization and coordination. Several experts have defined management, including George R. Terry, who describes it as activities aimed at achieving goals, performed by individuals contributing their best efforts through predetermined actions. This encompasses understanding what needs to be done, determining how to do it, understanding how it should be done, and measuring the effectiveness of these efforts.

W. Edwards Deming (1950) and Frederick Taylor (in Gasperz, 2002:2) view management as a system for continuous improvement in quality, applying the Deming Cycle method. This cycle consists of four steps for problem-solving: Plan, Do, Check, Action (PDCA). The cycle starts by identifying a problem through evaluation (Check), determining the cause, and then implementing corrective actions to solve the problem. The Deming Cycle works continuously through these four steps. This management cycle is a reference for quality assurance activities and uses repeated cycles in business processes for ongoing control and development of processes, products, and services. The acronym stands for the stages in the cycle: Plan, Do, Check, Action. Based on the theories above, this process must continue without interruption, as illustrated by the Deming Cycle.



Figure 1. The Deming Cycle
(Source: SlideGeeks)

3. Research Methods

Case study research is one of several types of qualitative research that analyzes individuals, groups, events, decisions, periods, or other systems holistically using one or more methods. This approach not only provides factual reports but also offers insights that can further develop research materials.

3.1. Data Collection Techniques

To determine the appropriate data collection techniques, researchers should identify the questions formulated in the research focus. Each question may require different data collection techniques.

- a. Interviews the interview process begins with issues outlined in the interview guide. Unlike in quantitative research, this guide does not act as a schedule. The sequence of questions may vary for each participant, depending on the flow of the interview and individual responses.
- b. Observation in research refers to focusing on an object by using all the senses to gather data. It is a direct observation method that involves sight, smell, hearing, touch, and, if necessary, taste. The instrument used in observation can be an observation guide.
- c. Focus Group Discussions (FGD), is a data collection technique used in qualitative research, aimed at gathering specific data rather than disseminating information or making decisions.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1. Curriculum Management Planning Based on KKNi

4.2. The planning process begins with the socialization of the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNi) by the head of the study program.

Further socialization is conducted by the faculty under the dean's direction, holding meetings with lecturers, both permanent and non-permanent. The study program also reminds lecturers to implement the plan in the classroom via a lecturer group chat. Additionally, a workshop on culture and curriculum is conducted, grouping lecturers to create uniform semester learning plans (RPS).

The creation of RPS is aligned with English learning outcomes, covering four key areas: attitude, work ability, knowledge, and responsibility. English learning outcomes encompass the skills acquired through the internalization of knowledge, attitudes, skills, competencies, and accumulated work experience, serving as benchmarks for assessing the effectiveness of both structured and unstructured learning processes. The four key elements of English learning outcomes are attitudes and values, work capabilities, knowledge mastery, and authority and responsibility.

4.3. The Importance of Learning and Assessment Systems in Achieving the Vision and Mission of the English Education Program at Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang.

A systematic learning and assessment system is essential for realizing the vision and mission of the English Education Program at Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang to

improve the quality of graduates. The following are interpretations of the importance of these systems:

- a. **Global-Oriented Learning Paradigm** To achieve the program's vision and mission, the learning system must adopt a higher education paradigm that is globally oriented, participatory-democratic, and humanistic. Through the four pillars of education (learning to know, learning to do, learning to live together, and learning to be), students are developed into intelligent individuals, skilled, adaptable to social changes, and possessing strong character.
- b. **Student-Centered Learning Approach** The learning system must adopt a student-centered learning approach (Student-Centered Learning). In this approach, students actively construct knowledge, participate in information gathering, and engage in the learning environment. This promotes independence and active participation in achieving KKNi competencies.
- c. **Integrated Learning Phases** The system must integrate all learning phases, from planning to execution and development. Planning includes developing an integrated assessment system aligned with learning activities. During execution, students are expected to actively demonstrate their performance and receive feedback for improvement. Reflection at the end of each meeting informs the planning and execution of the following session.
- d. **Synergy Between Learning Components** The system must create synergy and continuity between curriculum documents, GBPP (General Course Plan), SAP (Syllabus and Teaching Plan), RPS (Semester Learning Plans), students, learning resources, interactions, and the learning environment. All learning activities should stem from the curriculum documents, ensuring consistency in implementation.
- e. **Lecturers' Role as Facilitators and Motivators** Lecturers play a crucial role as facilitators and motivators in the learning system. They are responsible for designing learning strategies and environments that support student-centered learning. Additionally, they assist students in accessing, organizing, and processing information to solve problems and identify suitable assessment patterns.
- f. **Varied Learning Methods** The learning system should consider the effectiveness, efficiency, and level of student difficulty, along with the content, and available facilities. Various methods, such as small group discussions, role-plays & simulations, case studies, and other approaches, should be selected based on the context and learning objectives.
- g. **Continuous Evaluation and Development** A comprehensive plan for continuous evaluation and development must be in place. Periodic evaluations help measure the effectiveness of learning and identify areas for improvement. Continuous development ensures that the curriculum and learning system remain up to date with the latest developments and labor market demands.

By implementing a systematic and integrated learning system, the English Education Program at Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang can produce competent, high-quality graduates ready to compete in the workforce. A student-centered approach, integration of competencies, and focus on synergy and collaboration among learning elements ensure the achievement of the program's vision and mission in enhancing graduate quality.

4.4. Organizing Curriculum Management Based on KKNi

The Importance of Organizing Curriculum Management Based on KKNi in the English Study Program to Improve the Quality of University Graduates.

Organizing curriculum management based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNI) in the English Study Program is crucial for improving the quality of university graduates. The following points explain the significance of such organization:

- a. **Relevant Curriculum Design** Organizing curriculum management begins with designing a curriculum that aligns with competency standards. By involving teaching staff, industry stakeholders, and relevant parties, universities can identify labor market needs and ensure that the competencies taught meet professional demands. A relevant curriculum equips students with up-to-date skills and knowledge.
- b. **Integration of Competencies and Skills** The curriculum management must ensure that each course is well-integrated to holistically develop students' competencies and skills. As a result, graduates will possess language proficiency, speaking, writing, translation, and communication skills, as well as intercultural abilities essential in a global work environment.
- c. **Flexibility in Course Selection** Offering flexibility in course selection is a strategic step in curriculum management. By providing diverse elective courses, students can choose specializations that align with their interests and potential, allowing them to tailor their education to their desired career paths.
- d. **Project-Based and Practical Learning Approaches** Implementing project-based and practical learning approaches effectively prepares students with practical skills relevant to the workforce. Through hands-on experiences, students can develop practical abilities that can be directly applied in their future careers.
- e. **Role of Lecturers and Teaching Staff** Curriculum management involves a significant role for lecturers and teaching staff. Lecturers should provide quality teaching, inspire students, and support them in achieving competencies. Professional development and training for lecturers are essential to keep them updated with the latest trends in the English field and ensure effective teaching.
- f. **Comprehensive Assessment System** Curriculum management requires a comprehensive assessment system to measure student competency achievement. By using various assessment methods such as written exams, project tasks, presentations, and portfolios, universities can gain a complete picture of student abilities and identify areas for improvement.
- g. **Continuous Evaluation and Improvement** Curriculum management must involve continuous evaluation and improvement. Regular evaluations help universities measure the curriculum's effectiveness and ensure it remains relevant to current trends and labor market needs. Adjustments and improvements can be made based on feedback from students, alumni, and industry stakeholders.

4.5. Implementation of KKNI-Based Curriculum Management

In the implementation of the curriculum management for English language courses, several key elements are evident. When teaching English, the lecturer begins with an agreement on the course contract and the tasks to be completed by students throughout the semester. The lecturer provides a structured task format and allows flexibility regarding format, guidance, and rules for completing tasks. Additionally, the lecturer assesses student tasks based on the National Qualifications Framework (KKNI), with each task contributing different percentages to the final grade.

The evaluation process involves the academic program collecting lecturers' Semester Learning Plans (RPS), supported by staff who track which lecturers have submitted their plans. The program is also assisted by the quality control unit to ensure the plans align with the

National Qualifications Framework. Furthermore, the program monitors teaching, including using secret attendance reports for English lecturers. Surveys are distributed to students online to measure their satisfaction with the lecturers' teaching, though this process faces challenges due to low student participation.



Figure 2. Implementation of KKNI-Based Curriculum
(Source: Atlantis Press)

Students' perceptions of the implementation of the KKNI-based curriculum in the English department highlight its role in enhancing graduate quality at Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang. Interviews with third and final-semester students indicate that the grading system is aligned with curriculum guidelines and agreed learning outcomes, aiming for effective learning and ensuring graduates meet job market demands. Key elements of the assessment system include:

- a. Principles of Assessment: These principles focus on being educational (promoting learning), authentic (reflecting real-life situations), objective (free from bias), accountable (transparent and measurable), and transparent (clear and open processes).
- b. Assessment Techniques: These encompass cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains through methods such as observation, participation, performance tasks, written and oral tests, and surveys, ensuring a comprehensive evaluation of student capabilities.
- c. Assessment Process in Student-Centered Learning (SCL): Continuous assessment takes place throughout the SCL process, allowing lecturers to provide guidance. Performance assessments use rubrics (descriptive, holistic, and perception scales) to gauge student achievement.
- d. Definition of Authentic/Performance Assessment: This assessment evaluates students' ability to apply knowledge and skills in real-life scenarios, covering both the learning process and its outcomes.
- e. Feedback and Grading: Grades are not just numerical but include constructive feedback to help students understand their strengths and areas for improvement.
- f. Lecturer's Role in Assessment: Lecturers play a central role in designing, implementing, and evaluating assessments, ensuring transparency and accountability in measuring students' learning outcomes.

4.6. Evaluation of KKNi-Based Curriculum Management

The evaluation of KKNi-based curriculum management in the English Department at Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang highlights several improvements. Since the program's inception in 2013, the following changes have been noted:

- a. Infrastructure: Initially, facilities were inadequate, but with the implementation of the 2015 curriculum, improvements were made to support teaching and learning.
- b. Human Resources: Initially, there were few permanent lecturers, but by 2015, the number of both permanent and adjunct lecturers increased to meet curriculum needs.
- c. Learning System: In 2013, only 20% of courses had structured syllabi and lesson plans (SAP). By 2015, over 90% of courses were equipped with these materials.
- d. Information System: Initially manual, the system was transitioned to online by 2015 for student grade input and course registration.
- e. Program Management: Initially managed solely by the program head, the organizational structure expanded and became more comprehensive with the 2015 curriculum.

4.7. Challenges in KKNi-Based Curriculum Management

The challenges and solutions in implementing KKNi-based curriculum management at Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang and Universitas Syech Yusuf Tangerang are as follows:

- a. Alignment with Professional Standards: Ensuring that the curriculum meets the standards of professions related to English, such as teaching, translation, and interpretation, is crucial. Collaboration with industry professionals is needed to keep the curriculum relevant.
- b. Limited Resources: Adequate human resources, technology, and infrastructure are essential for implementing the KKNi curriculum. Proper planning and budget allocation can help address these limitations.
- c. Lecturer Preparedness: Lecturers must be well-versed in KKNi-based curriculum methods. Training programs can enhance their readiness for effective implementation.
- d. Limited Industry Involvement: A lack of collaboration with industries can make the curriculum less relevant to market needs. Partnerships with industries are essential for ensuring the curriculum stays up to date with job demands.
- e. Course Selection and Credit Allocation: Proper course selection and credit weighting are critical for curriculum development. Thorough evaluation is needed to ensure that courses align with students' needs and the credits reflect the course difficulty level.

5. Conclusion and Suggestion

5.1. Conclusion

Based on the analysis and findings, the following conclusions can be drawn:

- a. Planning: The KKNi-based curriculum management program in the English Department at Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang and Universitas Islam Syekh Yusuf Tangerang follows the universities' vision and mission. The curriculum is well-planned, with clear activities, targets, and strategies.
- b. Organization: The organization of the KKNi-based curriculum management program in the English Department includes a structured curriculum management team responsible for developing and overseeing the curriculum.

- c. Implementation: Implementation involves curriculum development, scheduling, human resources, partnerships with industries, and adequate facilities to support learning.
- d. Evaluation: The curriculum is evaluated using specific models to identify strengths and weaknesses, allowing for continuous improvement and adaptation to enhance graduate quality.
- e. Challenges: Supporting factors include university and lecturer efforts in implementing the curriculum, while challenges include resource limitations and resistance to change.

5.2. Suggestion

Based on the conclusions and implications of the research on curriculum management based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNI), there are key issues that higher education institutions must address, particularly concerning the implementation of English language learning. Therefore, the author proposes the following recommendations:

- a. For policy makers the recommendations for policy makers include:
 - a. Ensuring that policies related to curriculum management are based on accurate data and input from various stakeholders, including lecturers, students, and industry representatives.
 - b. Conducting comparative studies and benchmarking with similar study programs at other universities that have successfully implemented curriculum management.
 - c. Providing support and incentives for lecturers to participate in professional development and training related to curriculum, ensuring that their competencies accurately reflect their actual expertise.
- b. For lecturers the recommendations for lecturers include:
 - a. Adopting a proactive approach in implementing KKNI-based curriculum management and viewing it as an opportunity to innovate in teaching methods.
 - b. Increasing motivation and enthusiasm in developing curricula that are relevant to the job market and meet students' needs.
 - c. Participating in training and development programs related to curriculum to enhance their competence as professional educators and scholars.
- c. For Higher education institutions the recommendations for higher education institutions include:
 - a. Providing sufficient support and facilities for lecturers to develop innovative curricula.
 - b. Encouraging collaboration between lecturers, industry, and other academic communities to integrate job market demands into the curriculum.
 - c. Continuously evaluating and monitoring the curriculum implementation to ensure the achievement of goals and relevant updates.
- d. For future researchers the recommendations for future researchers include:
 - a. Offering insights and scientific thinking on KKNI-based curriculum management supported by relevant research findings.
 - b. Conducting further research to develop the best models and approaches for implementing the curriculum.
 - c. Following up on research findings with concrete actions and support for curriculum development in higher education institutions.

Reference

- Abdul Haris, "Formulation of Graduate Learning Outcomes (CPL) for the KKNI Curriculum of Islamic Religious Education," *Study of Islamic Education*, VII (2019), 74–75.
- Abdul Ghofur, "Al-Ghazali's Sufism: Foundations of Islamic Educational Psychology," *Islam Nusantara*, 02.01 (2018), 1–16.
- Abdul Rahim Karim, "Educational Thought According to Ikhwan As-Shafa," *Islamic Education*, 9439 (2020), 122–32.

- Abdul Hakim and N. Hani Herlina, "Integrated Curriculum Management at the Modern Daarul Huda Islamic Boarding School," *"Journal of Islamic Education Research"*, 6.1 (2018), 111.
- Abdul Halik, "Islamic Education: Perspectives on Ontology, Epistemology, and Axiology," *"Islamic Education and Thought"*, 7 (2020).
- Ach. Sayyi, "Modernization of Islamic Education Curriculum from the Perspective of Azyumardi Azra," *Islamic Education Curriculum*, 12 (2017).
- Ahmad Khoirun Na'im Az Zuhdi, "The Concept of Islamic Education According to Kh. Ahmad Dahlan and Its Relevance to National Education Goals" (State Institute for Islamic Studies Ponorogo, 2019).
- Ahmad Sukri Harahap, "Islamic Education Methods from the Perspective of Islamic Educational Philosophy," *"Hikmah Journal"*, 15.1 (2008), 13–20.
- Abdul Haris, "Qualifications of KKNi Curriculum," *"Study of Islamic Education"*, VII.2, 75.
- Andi Hidayat, "Islamic Education Methods for the Millennial Generation," *"Phenomenon"*, 10.1 (2018), 55–76.
- Akbar, Ilham, Mahmud Arif, and Januariansyah Arfaizar, "Axiology of Islamic Education," *Islamic Education*, 6 (2021), 13–22.
- Al-affan, "Journal of Islamic Education Al-Affan," *Islamic Education*, 2.2 (2022), 258–62.
- Ali Akbar Jen0, "Study on the Implementation of KKNi-Based Curriculum in English Language Education Programs in Teacher Education Institutions in Bengkulu City," 4 (2016), 60.
- Amiroh, Nurni, Dwi Isma, and Budi Purwoko, "A Literature Study on the Application of Narrative Counseling in Education," *Narrative Counseling in Education*, 8.2 (2018), 79–90.
- Ayu Lestari, "The Identity of Ikhwan As-Shafa and the Implications of Ecological Values in Their Cosmological Theory" (UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2019).
- Ahmad Badi', "Ijtihad: Theory and Application," *Islamic Thought Journal*, 24.2 (2015), 28–47.
- Dedi Lazuardi, "Curriculum Management as a Means for Educational Goals Development," 7.1 (2017), 99–112.
- Dodi Ilham, "Issues in Islamic Educational Philosophy," *"Didaktika"*, 9.2 (2020).
- Elisa, "The Meaning, Role, and Function of Curriculum," *"Education"*, 2013, 1–12.
- Farid Hijab, "The History of Ikhwan As-Shafa's Development," in *"Epistemology of Ikhwan As-Shafa"*, ed. Hafidz Hasyim and Ahmadiono (Pustaka Belajar, Yogyakarta, 2011), pp. 77–78.
- Fithriani, "Implications of Axiology in Philosophy of Education," *"Intellectuality"*, 5 (2017), 83–92.
- Goldziher, "The History of Ikhwan As-Shafa's Development," in *"Epistemology of Ikhwan As-Shafa"*, ed. Hafidz Hasyim and Ahmadiono (Pustaka Belajar, Yogyakarta, 2011), p. 76.
- Himayatul Izzati, "Environmental Thought in Ikhwan Al-Shafa's Education," *"Biography of Ikhwan Al-Shafa"*, 117–26.
- Himayatul Izzati, "The Works of Ikhwan As-Shafa," *"Philosophy of Education"*, 105–26.
- Ibnu Kaldun, "The History of Islamic Science Classification," *"Pustakaloka Journal of Information and Library Studies STAIN Ponorogo"*, 9.1 (2017), 147–164.
- Ian Richard Netton, "The History of Ikhwan As-Shafa's Development," in *"Epistemology of Ikhwan As-Shafa"*, ed. Hafidz Hasyim and Ahmadiono (Pustaka Belajar, Yogyakarta, 2011), p. 76.
- Irja Putra Pratama, "Islamic Education Reform in Indonesia," *"PAI Raden Fatah"*, 1 (2019), 1–6.

- Indah Husnul Khotimah, "Axiological Dimensions of Islamic Education," "Islamic Education", December 2018.
- Jalaluddin and Prof. Dr. H. Abdullah Idi, "Philosophy of Education," in "Philosophy of Education" (Manusia, Filsafat, Pendidikan), 2nd edn (Kharisma Putra Utama Offset, 2017), pp. 10–229.
- Jenilan, "Philosophy of Education," "Islamic Thought and Hadith Interpretation", 7 (2018).
- Kaharuddin and Abdus Sahid, "Hadith as a Source of Islamic Law: A Review of Inkar As-Sunnah, Shia, and Orientalists' Perspectives," "TAJDID: Journal of Islamic Thought and Humanism", 2.2 (2018), 457–67.
- Khaerul Anwar, "The Educational Thoughts of Ikhwanus Shafa and Their Relevance to Globalization," "Islamic Education", 2.02 (2019), 254–67.
- Khoirun Nisa, "The Concept of Islamic Educational Philosophy and Its Implications for Curriculum Development in Islamic Education," 2.November (2017), 125–36.
- Khaerul Anwar, "The Educational Thoughts of Ikhwanus Shafa and Their Relevance to Globalization," Islamic Education, 2.02 (2019), 254–67.
- M. Asri, "Curriculum Dynamics in Indonesia," Modelling: Journal of PGMI Program Studies, 4.2 (2017), 192–202.
- M. Kholil Asy'ari, "Methods of Islamic Education," Qathruna, 1.1 (2014), 193–205.
- Muniron At-Tauhidi, "The Emergence of Ikhwan As-Shafa," in Epistemology of Ikhwan As-Shafa, ed. Hafidz Hasyim and Ahmadiono, I (Pustaka Belajar, Yogyakarta, 2011), p. 75.
- Muniron, "History of Ikhwan As-Shafa's Development," in Epistemology of Ikhwan As-Shafa, ed. by Hanif Hafidz and Ahmadiono, I (Pustaka Belajar, Yogyakarta, 2011), p. 83.
- Moh. Zainol Kamal Hairus Sodik, "Biography of Ikhwan As-Shafa," "Pustaka", 6 (2018), 95.
- Mohammad Mustaf Hamdi, "Curriculum Evaluation in Islamic Education," "Intizam: Journal of Islamic Education Management", 4.1 (2020), 66–75.
- Rahmat Hidayat, "Islamic Education as a Science," "Rahmat Hidayat", I.1 (2016), 1–22.
- Rahmat Hidayat, "Islamic Education Curriculum," in "Islamic Education Science", ed. Dr. Ahmad, M.Pd Dr. H. Candra Wijaya, 1st edn (LPPPI, 2016), pp. 89–289.
- Sarno Hanipudin, "Islamic Education in Indonesia Throughout the Ages," "Matan: Journal of Islam and Muslim Society", 1.1 (2019), 39.
- Tri Effiyanti, Dita Eka Pratiwi, and Muhammad Bukhori Dalimunthe, "Development of Learning Tools Oriented Towards KKNi," Niagawan, 7.1 (2018), 44–49.
- Zul Kifli, "The Concept of Education in Islam," "Rausyan Fikr: Journal of Thought and Enlightenment", 15.2 (2019), 65–71.
- Zahira Irahmani Arrovia, "Comparison of Educational Goals Concepts Between Ikhwan Al-Safa and Islamic Education in Indonesia During the Reform Movement," "Islamic Religious Education, 2.1 (2021), 1–17.